

Similar Cultures, Similar Problems: Art Education Programs in Northern and Southern Cyprus

Cigdem Hursen¹ and Fatma Miralay²

*Near East University, Ataturk Faculty of Education, Department of Educational
Programs and Instruction, Nicosia, North Cyprus, Postal Code: 922022*

Telephone: (+90 392) 223 64 64

E-mail: ¹<cigdem.hursen@neu.edu.tr>, ²<fatma.miralay@neu.edu.tr>

KEYWORDS Art. Bicomunal. Comparative. Curriculum. Education. Teacher

ABSTRACT Evaluation of the 8th grade art education programs implemented by the private secondary schools located in Northern and Southern parts of Cyprus is the main topic of this research. A qualitative method was used throughout the research and the data indicates that in both parts of Cyprus, there are similar structures and viewpoints regarding the art education programs. The findings reveal that insufficient weekly course hours and the overall duration of courses are the weakest aspects of these programs, the content of the art education curriculum ought to be reviewed by the ministries of education, and the art education programs should be supported by the course books updated by the ministries of education, and subjects concerning Art History, Cyprus Art and Culture should be included in the 8th grade art education curriculum. It was also found that the extracurricular activities, such as art trips, should be included within the program.

INTRODUCTION

Today, science and technology are fast developing, and societies are required to follow these changes and developments as the technological developments bring in innovations and advancements as well as bringing in new habits that make the lifecycle of communities easier (Park et al. 2015; Jena 2015; Miller 2016; Mesquita and Peres 2016; Tondeur et al. 2016). The outcomes of these developments are extremely effective in the field of educational sciences as well as all areas of society. It should not be forgotten that individuals that make up a society should also be able to adapt to emerging changes for the development of the society (Khan and Law 2015; Uztosun and Troudi 2015; Lingard and McGregor 2014). The other perspectives of anthropology and anthropological studies help societies establish a better place to live in, and provide information on historical and cultural backgrounds on the social lifecycle in order to raise awareness and develop a sense of responsibility of individuals (Sauptin 2015; Bertacchini and Segre 2016; Vella 2016). These kind of studies help explore the problem of education in anthropological perspectives, as well as finding out educational and cultural changes in societies. In this respect, cultural education plays an important role in lifecycles of societies in learning about their own past and generating plans for their future (Higgins 2016; Ladkin 2016). Be-

sides, the education curricula, an important component of the education systems, ensure that the children obtain a proper education, and consequently, take part in society as creative, critical minded and productive individuals capable of following developments and innovations. As part of this process the phenomenon of culture is a dynamic and living entity passing on from generation to generation, and changes and values inherited through the culture adds new elements to lifestyles and identities of people. People should be more aware about the importance of this issue, and education should play an important role in development of social values (Sparapani et al. 2014; Jeong 2016; Ocal 2016).

Ball (2016) says that one of the greatest challenges facing the global society is the preparation of students culturally in classrooms for the future. It is important to improve education programs by renewing them in accordance with the variables of cultural values. This is significant in terms of ensuring a better response to the basic education requirements of students (Priestley et al. 2014). According to Priestley et al. (2014), education programs have a guiding role in creating an identity for the future of countries, by providing contributions respectively to social, cultural and economic developments. There are many studies about education programs (Sparapani et al. 2014). Murray (2016) emphasizes that the education programs must be developed in accordance with the contempo-

rary and international requirements as well as in consideration with the needs of students. It is believed that the programs that are generated for teachers and students are designed in line with the determined objectives based on the specific needs of students, and in more general terms, on the specific needs of societies. It is also suggested that the enrichment of program content with various branches of education will provide a positive impact on learning outcomes (Rohaana and Keulen 2011; Gresnigt et al. 2014). However, Arikan and Dogan (2013) refer to the historical and social function of education programs from a different point of view. According to Arikan and Dogan (2013), education programs are the most important sources for transferring cultural values to younger generations. Smith and Otto (2016) state that the progress of cultural change in the communities is strictly connected to cultural anthropology. Dombayci (2014) refers to importance of the history of cultures in societies and claims that it must be explored throughout the anthropological approaches. According to Berkemeyer et al. (2016), there is no any other approach more effective than teaching and dissemination of the cultural aspects within the education systems. According to Yigitler (2016), this emphasizes the importance of cultural exchange and transfer of historical values. Similarly, Buyurgan and Buyurgan (2012), claiming that education programs are the main transmitters of cultural values, draw attention to the importance of the adoption of cultural values by students.

The importance of the past as well as present is emphasized in order to contribute to the development of mutual relationships between each other (Bekerman and Zembylas 2016). According to Lee (2014), before the transfer cultural values, the relations with cultural anthropology and evolution of human culture and history should be investigated in human society. Apart from these, it is emphasized that learning of cultural aspects and values must be carried out throughout the education systems and specifically designed courses could be integrated into the education system for this (Cosumov 2016; Wan and Scott 2016). The literature review reveals that art education programs are an effective means to pass on the cultural values (Costes and Caleon 2016; Woywod and Deal 2016; Vermeersch 2016).

Cultural values are gained by students during the context dimension of programs (Morley 2014; Kafola et al. 2015; Kurudayioglu and Sahin 2015). The existing literature demonstrates that the art education programs have a great importance in cultivating critical thinking skills and encouraging individuals to learn their own culture and transfer it to other generations (Ertürk 2013; Tüzel 2013). Kuttner (2015) indicates that the art education programs provide individuals not only with dexterity, creativity and artistic skills but also with a contribution to their overall personal development. Art education programs, which develop in individuals, have a major role in paving the way for countries towards development and stepping beyond the era in cultural sense.

Gates (2016), while pointing out that there is always a need of making alterations and changes in the art education programs in line with the needs and requirements of the stakeholders, emphasizes that the quality of the programs will also increase with these changes and alterations. In this respect, it is always necessary to develop the content of the art education programs in terms of their effectiveness, as well as evaluating the effectiveness in terms of functionality.

Gaztambide et al. (2016) claim that it is necessary for each culture to compare their own art education programs with art education programs of other countries in order to find the needs and insufficient aspects of the programs. Besides, they emphasize that the art programs should include the aspects of the cultural and artistic values of the other cultures, as well as integrating the historic progress and traditional aspects of various cultural. This will lead to comparative analysis of art education curricula. In this respect, Caetona et al. (2016) states that the comparative analysis of art education curricula will contribute to the widening and developing of a country's art and culture and conveying it effectively to new generations.

Kalemoglu (2015) underlines the significance of conducting comparative evaluations of art education curricula, not only in transnational dimensions but also in communal dimensions. Particularly in bicomunal countries, comparative analysis of art education curricula is considered important in identifying cultural similarities and motivating communities to be more successful with each other. Touching upon the role of comparative education research studies

in building the peace, especially in communities (Scott 2016), that have experienced conflict, Nickolaou (2012), argues that comparative analysis of art education programs can generate a positive impact in bicultural countries.

Problem Statement

What are the differences between Turkish and Greek Cypriot Art Education programs according to views of the Greek and Turkish Cypriot art teachers?

Objectives of the Research

In this context, the aim of this research is the evaluation of 8th grade art education programs, which are implemented in private secondary schools in Northern and Southern Cyprus, according to the views of the teachers. To this end, answers were sought for the following questions, according to the teachers' views regarding the evaluation of the North and South Cyprus private secondary schools 8th grade art education curricula with Stufflebeam CIPP model:

1. What are the weakest and strongest aspects for the context dimension?
2. How is the input dimension evaluated?
3. How is the process dimension evaluated?
4. How is the product dimension evaluated?

Significance of the Research

According to literature review, there are no existing research papers that have been conducted within this scope on Turkish and Greek communities living in Northern and Southern parts of Cyprus. This is a major shortcoming. Moreover, in Cyprus most of the studies that do exist are focused on Turkish and Greek history courses and there are no comparative art education researches in literature review. It is believed that this stems from the sociopolitical situation of the island of Cyprus (Papadakis and Be 2008; Philippou et al. 2008; Baskan and Koruroglu 2013; Lyrta 2014). Art, with its universal language, its neutral expression, its peaceful philosophy and capacity to connect communities, is considered important for the rapprochement of the two communities.

Comparative Art Education Program

Touching upon the importance of art education curricula, Bauer and Strauss (2014) indicate

that art education is an important factor that affects the career of individuals in later periods. Schlosnagle et al. (2014) discuss the evaluation process of art education curricula and indicate that the evaluation of art programs ensures the development of societies in an artistic sense. This contributes to individuals increasing their self-esteem. According to Schlosnagle et al. (2014), evaluation of art education programs is an effective step towards an exact determination of the needs of society and individuals. Mamur (2010) has the same point of view. He underlines that the evaluation of art education curricula provides an opportunity to determine whether students achieve the objectives of the program or not. Providing opportunities for societies to transmit their own cultures, art education programs (Morley 2014) allow the development of psychomotor skills and cognitive learning (Ayres 2015). Bevers (2010) indicates that countries vary from each other in terms of transferring national cultures. He states that the national cultural criteria of countries can be determined more clearly by comparing their art education curricula. Transnational comparison of art education curricula has a guiding role in following up development across the world (Tüzel 2013). It holds a significant place in educational ideologies in terms of reflecting the cultures of different societies in their art education programs (Morley 2014). According to Fernandez et al. (2014), comparative evaluation of art education curricula is useful for revealing the cultures of different countries. It is believed that the comparative evaluation of art education curricula will also be useful for the realization of effective cultural production and the improvement of national art education standards. Moreover, comparative art education is necessary between countries but also between similar societies (Kalemoglu 2011). In this context, the comparative evaluation of art education curricula helps identify teaching methods and techniques, as well as the goals of art education programs implemented in different countries. It shapes the culture and art policies of countries (Wyse and Ferrari 2015; Dewey 2008).

METHODOLOGY

Population and Sample

This research was carried out with 8th grade art teachers serving in private secondary schools located in both southern and northern

parts of Nicosia, Cyprus. This research evaluates the teachers' views regarding art education curricula for the 8th grade. In order to ensure the reliability of data, importance was placed on the voluntariness of the teachers who participated in the research from both sides. Island-wide, 85 art teachers serve in the Southern area while only 14 serve in the Northern part of Cyprus. Since the number of art teachers is not equal on both sides, the research was limited to 12 art teachers serving in Northern and Southern parts of Cyprus. In order to ensure a fair and equal distribution for the research, six Turkish Cypriot and six Greek Cypriot art teachers participated in the research. 11 of them were female and one was male. Nine were within the 20 to 25 age range and three of them were over 40 years old. Five teachers had a postgraduate degree and seven had a bachelor's degree. When the seniority of the participant teachers was examined, the seniority of the Turkish Cypriot teachers varied from one to five years, while the seniority of Greek Cypriot teachers ranged from six to ten years. While the Turkish Cypriot art teachers had participated in in-service training programs regarding art once or twice in their careers. Greek Cypriot teachers participated in these programs three or four times. The Turkish Cypriot teachers participated in art exhibitions three or four times a year while the Greek Cypriot teachers participated in such events five or more times a year.

Research Model

A qualitative research method has been used in this research. The qualitative research method includes data collection methods and using various semi-structured or unstructured techniques (Smith 2016). These methods and approaches focused on underlying opinions, reasons and motivations. Qualitative research provides percepts into the problems or develop ideas and hypotheses in significant findings. Also, used to expose trends in hypothesis and opinions, and deep research into the problem (Levina et al. 2015).

Instruments

In order to determine the views of teachers regarding art education curricula, semi-structured interview forms were developed by the

researchers for this research. In order to prepare the interview forms for art education curricula, the current situation was determined by reviewing the literature. As a result, the Stufflebeam CIPP model was proved to be the most appropriate and systematic way of evaluating the many different aspects of the art education programs (Gandomkar et al. 2015). The interview form was prepared to cover all dimensions of this model. While preparing semi-structured interview questions for the form, the researchers came together with four teachers (two from each location) serving in the Northern and Southern areas of Cyprus and asked their views regarding the art education curriculum. As a result of the literature review and the meeting with the teachers, a material pool was created and experts were consulted for their opinions. Meetings were held with experts consisting of five curriculum and education specialists, two art education specialists and five measurement and evaluation specialists. Consequently, corrections were suggested in line with the views of the experts. Eight articles out of 17 were considered insufficient in terms of context, field compliance, and clarity. Thus, these articles were removed from the interview form and the form was finalized with nine expressions. In order to ensure context validity, a preliminary application was applied to five Greek and five Turkish Cypriots and the data obtained through this application was analyzed. Thus, three more articles considered unnecessary by the researchers were removed from the form. In order to provide a better understanding for Turkish and Greek Cypriots, the interview form was written in two languages (Turkish and English). The Turkish interview form was for Turkish Cypriots and the English interview form was for the Greek Cypriots. The translation of the interview form was done by two interpreters whose native languages are English and Turkish. One interpreter is a Turkish specialist who knows English, and the other interpreter is an English specialist who knows Turkish. The traditional approach method (Evans et al. 2015) was used for translation. Questions were written in Turkish first, and then were translated into English. Later, these were translated again into the original Turkish language. Finally, equalization and meaning concordance between the two translations, as well as the language validity, were measured. For this purpose, questions were tested on a sample consisting of four persons who can speak both languages.

Application

The application was started in May 2015. As a result of investigation across the island of Cyprus, it was determined that there were 14 private secondary schools in the Northern part and 39 private secondary schools in the Southern part of Cyprus. The research was limited to four private secondary schools located in Northern and Southern parts of Nicosia. The voluntary basis of the research was the most basic reason for the delimitation of the research. It required a lengthy procedure to get permission to interview teachers working in state schools in the Southern part of Cyprus due to political reasons. Therefore, the research was carried out only with private secondary school teachers. The first phase of the research was initiated in the Southern location. In order to get permission for the application, the researchers held separate meetings with each of the 39 private secondary schools located in Southern Cyprus. As a result, only two private secondary schools permitted the application. Therefore, the research was limited to four private secondary schools consisting of two schools from Northern and two schools from Southern Cyprus. As a first step, a Greek school that the researchers named "School A" was visited. Prior to the interviews, the researchers gained the teachers' permission to share their views. All teachers were provided with information regarding the procedure and it was indicated that the personal and school information would be kept confidential. In order to share teachers' views regarding the art education curriculum, a question and answer based, face-to-face method was used. Application was carried out with three art teachers and all conversations throughout the interview process were recorded by the researchers. The teachers were informed that the recording would be paused when they did not want to answer any questions under recording conditions. The overall interview process lasted about 15 to 20 minutes. After completing the interview with the Greek teachers serving in School A, the application continued in another Greek school that the researchers named as School B. The same procedure was used. Interviews were held with three art teachers and the overall interview process lasted for approximately 15 to 20 minutes. After the completion of the interviews in the Southern location, the researchers continued the applica-

tion in two selected private secondary schools in the Northern area. After providing the required explanations, interviews were held with three art teachers working in School C in the Northern part of Cyprus. The interviews lasted about 15-20 minutes and were recorded. Finally, another Turkish school, School D was visited and interviews were held with three art teachers working in this school. The same procedure was followed. The approval of each teacher was received to ensure validity and reliability of the interview records. All interviews were carried out personally by the researchers.

First Impression of Two Communities' Art Teachers and Schools

During the first visit to School A, it was observed that the school was preferred by Turkish Cypriot students although it is located in the Southern part of Cyprus. While carrying out the study at the school, students speaking in Turkish or in Greek in the schoolyard and in classrooms were observed. A peaceful environment was ensured at the school. Three art teachers, consisting of two part-time female teachers and one full-time male teacher, exhibited a moderate approach to the research study. While visiting the classrooms and art studio during the interview process, it was observed that tools and materials required for art education were complete. It was observed that the art studios of schools that visited in Northern part were also spacious and comfortable. In this context, it was identified that the schools where interviews were conducted in both sides have similar features.

Data Analysis

Data collected from the participants was processed by qualitative data analysis. Semi-structured interview forms were used to collect research data and a sound recorder was used to record the interviews. Content analysis was used at the data analysis stage. Analysis was performed in three stages. In the first stage (coding the data), the collected data was examined comprehensively and classified into meaningful categories. During the second stage (identifying the themes), the themes were identified by benefiting from the results of the coding process. In the final stage, results were interpreted by arranging the data according to the codes and

themes that had been identified. In this research, the views of Turkish Cypriot teachers serving in the Northern part area and the views of Greek Cypriot teachers serving in the Southern part area were indicated by abbreviations T.T and G.T, respectively.

RESULTS

The views of the teachers regarding the 8th grade art education curricula were gathered under five themes. These themes were arranged and identified as follows, that is, “Strength of Curriculum”, “Weakness of Curriculum”, “Input”, “Process” and “Evaluation”.

Strengths

“What are the strengths of the art education program according to you?”

Questions regarding the strengths of the program were directed to both Turkish Cypriot and Greek Cypriot art teachers. The answers show that teachers from both sides have commonly held views that the art education curricula are aimed at the development of dexterity and creativity of students. They consider this to be the strongest aspect of the program. All teachers also believed that students gain and develop dexterity and creativity through course activities conducted within the frame of the curriculum. One of the Turkish Cypriot teachers (T.T) indicated that the basic benefit of art was conveyed to students through art courses that are implemented within the frame of art education curriculum (T.T.1). T.T.1 expressed his views as, *“I believe that the course develops the students’ dexterity”*.

One of the Greek Cypriot teachers (G.T) indicated that art education should be compulsory at all stages of education (G.T.7). Underlining that art education programs developed the dexterity of students, G.T.7 expressed the strength of the program as follows: *“It is a compulsory course that begins from primary school, for me, this is the most strongest aspect of the curriculum because children learn art at least up to a certain age and they develop their hand skills and imaginations”*. T.T.2, who thinks that art courses have a positive impact on student’s psychology, expresses his views as, *“I think that art courses have a positive impact on mental development, psychology and imagination of children because children increase their*

motivations in art courses by producing when they feel bored and overwhelmed in other courses”. Compared to other courses, *“Art courses attract students’ attention much more”*. In addition, T.T.2 underlines that the 8th grade students are subjected to an exam-oriented and very intensive program in the Northern part of Cyprus and art education programs have a mind-relaxing effect on students in this intensive environment.

Stating that 8th grade art education programs have created a sense of art in students and developed their dexterities, a Greek Cypriot teacher expressed his views as, *“We guide students to carry out training activities during art courses and art studio hours in order to develop their painting techniques and artistic visions. In addition, I believe that art education curriculum develops the creativity and imagination of the students”* (G.T.11). Data obtained from this research demonstrates that both Turkish Cypriot and Greek Cypriot teachers believe that the art education program is sufficient in terms of gaining dexterity.

Weaknesses

“What are the weaknesses of the art education program according to you?”

Questions regarding the weaker aspects of the program were directed to both Turkish Cypriot and Greek Cypriot art teachers. The answers suggest that both Turkish Cypriot and Greek Cypriot teachers have common views that insufficient course hours and duration of courses are the weakest aspects of the program. All the teachers that participated in this research expressed that they experienced serious problems in obtaining the required efficiency because of this. One of the Turkish Cypriot teachers (T.T.5) expressed his views as, *“We cannot process the subjects of the program in an efficient and complete manner due to insufficient course hours. The renewal of the curriculum is a necessity. For me, it is a major lack that our art curriculum doesn’t cover some subjects such as art history and aesthetics which are important for art courses”*. One of the Greek Cypriot teachers (G.T.11) stated similar views as, *“Every year, the program is renewed and revised on the basis of the experiences of the former program by us. As teachers, we try to support the course in many areas. For example, art history and culture are related with art but they are not covered by the*

program due to insufficient course hours. This is a major lack for us and students. I consider course hours quite delimiting". The expressions of the teachers point to the necessity of strengthening the 8th grade art education program so as to support art subjects, and not only by practical training but also in a theoretical sense. In addition, from the viewpoints of the teachers, it is understood that the contents of the 8th grade art education program and course durations are required to be consistent. All teachers (Turkish and Greek Cypriots), who expressed their views concerning the art education program, believe that art education curricula should be up to date. However, they emphasize that the Ministry of Education has not demonstrated the required diligence in this direction. The teachers serving on both sides highlighted that the innovations in the field of art education were included in the art program by them personally.

"Learning techniques only in art courses do not catch the fancy of many children. Art course should be supported with other activities. It should bring consciousness of social responsibility. Methods of dexterity should be increased, each child should be able to develop himself/herself within his/her capacity."

In expressing his views like this, T.T.4 stated that the art education programs should be supported with contemporary approaches instead of conventional training methods. Approaching the issue from a different perspective, G.T.3 expressed their views as, *"Unfortunately, people in Cyprus don't attach enough importance on art courses. I think, the parents fear that their children will choose art as profession because they believe that the children will have lower chance of finding a job in future and they can't earn money. Along with the art education programs, the parents should also undertake great responsibility for creating students' art consciousness"*. From the remarks of G.T.3, it is understood that parents have a crucial role to play in the creation of students' perspectives regarding art.

Input

"Do you believe that subjects such as Cyprus culture, Cypriot painter artists, art theory, aesthetics and art criticism are covered enough in the Art program?"

It has been questioned in the context dimension whether the 8th grade art program covers

Cyprus culture and Cypriot painter artists. It has also been questioned whether theoretical subjects, such as art history and aesthetics, are covered by the program. Teachers from both communities indicated that theoretical subjects were not covered by the program sufficiently, adding that these subjects should be in the program. T.T.5 commented, *"Since we don't have a specific textbook, subjects regarding our culture are taught personally by teachers. However, if we had a specific textbook, we would have the opportunity to convey more accurate information. Besides, subjects regarding the Cypriot painter artists cannot be covered sufficiently as the course hours are limited. A textbook must be prepared by the Ministry and the program renewal must be done"*.

In a similar way, G.T.2 expressed his views as, *"Here, the insufficiency of course hours unfortunately comes into play again. Art history subjects should be carried out in the drawing studies. Subjects concerning art history and aesthetics must be covered by the program"*. With these remarks, G.T.2 underlines the lack of content in the program. Data obtained from this research puts forth that both Turkish Cypriot and Greek Cypriot art teachers are in need of a source book for the course, and art courses should not cover only drawing subjects. The teachers shared the view that subjects such as Cyprus Culture and Cypriot painter artists need to be covered by the 8th grade art curriculum. Despite all this, T.T.2 indicated that she/he remedied the insufficiencies that originated from the program with his/her own possibilities. *"We hang the paintings of Cypriot painter artists in our corridors. In this way, we provide opportunities for our students to learn about the works of Cypriot painter artists. However, the program does not include information regarding Cyprus culture. It should necessarily be included"*. Moreover, G.T.3 states, *"Cypriot painter artists should be covered by the program and opportunities need to be provided for students to learn about Cypriot artists and their works as well as to learn and transfer their own culture"*. With this viewpoint, G.T.3 supports the views of Turkish Cypriot teachers regarding the issue. *"We have no art history and aesthetics courses in our school, however, these courses can be given to the students willing to take them"*. Here, T.T.5 highlights the importance of the theoretical dimension of the course. Expressing views

on the insufficiency of theoretical subjects, another participant, G.T.10, supported the views of other teachers by expressing his/her views regarding the insufficiency of theoretical subjects as, *“Unfortunately we can’t process theoretical subjects during art courses because the duration of the course is not sufficient to cover such topics. Therefore, we attach more importance on practical training of students and developing their dexterities. To me, the curriculum must be renewed in the line with the needs every year by the Ministry”*.

Data obtained from in this research puts forth that both Turkish Cypriot and Greek Cypriot art teachers consider it as a necessity that the 8th grade art curriculum should cover the subjects regarding art history and Cyprus culture. Teachers from both communities stated that the context of the art curriculum covers only the subjects concerning the improvement of dexterity, and notable deficiencies are experienced particularly in transferring cultural values to students.

Course Process and Classroom Activities

“Do you organize school trips? Do you visit places like museums and art galleries?”

Questions were posed to the art teachers from both communities in order to identify the extracurricular activities included in the 8th grade art curriculum. The result of the interviews demonstrated that the art teachers from both communities have common views regarding the issue. Both Turkish and Greek Cypriot teachers indicated that the 8th grade art curriculum was insufficient for extracurricular activities. T.T.1 expressed his/her views as, *“As our schools focus on exams and academic achievement, art trips are considered a waste of time and aren’t organized”*. G.T.6 stated, *“From time to time, art trips are organized by our initiatives. We generally visit the museums and exhibitions. If the school administration attaches more importance on art courses, such activities will increase”*. This draws attention to the fact that school administrations do not value the art courses enough. These expressions suggest that teachers from both communities consider the insouciance of the administrative units as the reason for the insufficient cultural trips. It is understood from the viewpoint of T.T.5 that extracurricular activities for art education are not

effective enough when she/he says, *“We don’t go on trips very often. But trips should necessarily be organized. The social development of students shouldn’t be ignored for the sake of implementing mathematics or similar courses predominantly. It will be much more beneficial for students to visit museums, art galleries and similar places where they can explore by seeing and learn by questioning”*. This indicates that teachers can only carry out trip activities during extracurricular hours, G.T.5 expressed his/her views as, *“I wish, we had the opportunity to go on cultural trips not only during extracurricular hours but also during normal course hours. But course hours and time are limited”*. G.T.5 draws attention to the insufficiency of the course hours and duration. Approaching the issue with a similar perspective, G.T.9 supports the views of other teachers by stating, *“We organize trips only twice a year. However, it is extremely difficult even to do this due to lack of time. We content ourselves with hanging the brochures regarding the artistic activities conducted in our surrounding.”* Data obtained demonstrates that art teachers from both communities have a consensus that cultural trips do not take place in the curricula sufficiently. The majority of the teachers that participated in this research believe that some environments, such as museums and art galleries, can provide an effective and lasting contribution for art training.

Evaluation

“What do you think about the evaluation process?”

In this phase, questions regarding measurement and evaluation dimensions of the art curriculum were directed at the participants. Teachers from both communities stated that product files and exhibitions were the most commonly used measurement tools. However, the teachers argued for the implementation of different measurement tools along with product files and exhibitions. For example, T.T.4 stated that, *“If we evaluate the students according to their oral and written works as well, we will get better results. Carrying out the evaluation just according to the exhibition that is held at the end of the academic year is not enough”*, T.T.4 underlines that the implementation of other measuring tools will be more useful. However, G.T.7 and G.T.12 approach the issue with a different

perspective, *"I evaluate each student according to a one-year project that she/he prepared. However, it will be better to carry out the evaluation with a jury composed of all art course teachers"*. As it is seen, an art course is mainly evaluated according to the drawings. T.T.1 expressed a similar opinion, *"If we evaluate the students according to their drawings and a written exam at the end of each term, the students will take the course into consideration more seriously. I believe, this will be a more accurate measurement for both students and teachers"*. In addition, the result of the meetings held with teachers from both communities demonstrates that they believe that the 8th grade students are frivolous and uninterested in the course. *"We grade students according to the work done at the end of the year. However, I think it is much more accurate to evaluate them throughout the year"*. With this statement, T.T.2 argues that the art education curriculum covers only the product evaluation. No evaluation for the process is carried out. Teachers' views reveal that the 8th grade art education program covers only product evaluation. However, the teachers believe that product evaluation, along with effective process evaluation, will bring more successful learning outcomes.

DISCUSSION

In this research, the researchers aimed to evaluate the 8th grade curricula implemented by private secondary schools in Northern and Southern Cyprus. For this purpose, the Stufflebeam CIPP evaluation model was used to evaluate the curricula according to the views of art teachers who participated in this research voluntarily. The results obtained from this research demonstrate that the 8th grade art education curricula implemented in both communities cover similar aspects in terms of the "context" dimension. Art teachers from both communities put forth that gainings are among the strongest aspects of the 8th grade art education curricula. Both Turkish Cypriot and Greek Cypriot teachers think that gainings contribute to students to develop psychomotor behaviors (See and Kokotaski 2016) for their dexterities. There are various studies in literature that support the outcome of this research (Autio et al. 2012; Ertürk 2013; Tüzel 2013; Kuttner 2015; Ispihani and Anwar 2016). However, it is emphasized in litera-

ture that art education curricula should also cover subjects for the development of some qualifications such as healthy communication, sensitivity for cultural values, aesthetic sensibility and consciousness for the preservation of art works. Apart from this, ability to empathize, liberal thinking ability and awareness in protecting the cultural and peace related values must be developed (Coholic and Eys 2016; Hallam et al. 2016; Koo 2015). According to the views of art teachers from both communities, the insufficient weekly course hours are the weakest aspects of the 8th grade art education curricula. According to them, the program covers an intensive content but the time required to implement this content is extremely limited. This situation causes trouble for students to achieve the gains projected by the program. In addition, teachers from both communities have a consensus that the 8th grade art education curricula are out of date and insufficient to keep abreast the developments today. Besides, the art teachers have a consensus that the program is weak in terms of theoretical art subjects. Kahraman (2014) obtained a similar result that art education curricula were not consistent in terms of context and process, and at the same time, it is assumed that implementing the art history courses and painting courses at the same time would provide significant contribution to art education (Bryan and Wilson 2016; Vella 2016; Walmsley 2016; Waltson and Salter 2016; Sinclair 2015). According to Kahraman (2014), the planning of context and process in a consistent manner provides a positive increase in students' achievements.

The outcomes in this research also demonstrate that the 8th grade art education curricula of both communities have similar characteristics. As well as, social and cultural anthropology researches figure out of the communities' cultural value and also uncovering of their social and ethnic similarities (Monaghan et al. 2016). According to the views of the teachers serving in Northern or Southern of Cyprus, the content of the 8th grade art education curricula should be rearranged and the program should cover more theoretical subjects concerning art. Art education programs and especially their theoretical inputs intended to provide students to learn their own cultural heritage cultural anthropology (Pinilla et al. 2016) and their art histories. According to Bekerman and Zembylas (2016), discuss the culture, and ethnic national charac-

ter had been structured, and how the education of national structured were consequent to, impacting different kind of projects for peace education in Cyprus.

Besides, teachers put forth that the curricula should cover subjects such as art history, Cyprus culture, Cypriot painter artists and aesthetics. In a similar way, Akhmetov et al. (2015) refer to the necessity that art education curricula should cover the country's own folkloric and cultural anthropology (Gun 2015) in the context dimension. Garnet (2012) highlights that art education curricula that cover theoretical subjects in the context contribute to students to develop their practical applications as well. The outcomes of the research that conducted by Gates at al. (2015) support the results obtained from this research and emphasize the necessity that art education curricula should cover more theoretical subjects regarding art.

When the researchers evaluate the context of the 8th grade art education curricula in line with Stufflebeam CIPP evaluation model, it becomes apparent that extracurricular learning activities are insufficient in both communities. The 8th grade art education curriculum that is implemented in Northern and Southern Cyprus is particularly inadequate in terms of exhibition and museum tours. Teachers, who participated in this research and expressed their views, believe that extracurricular trips are necessary for students to become acquainted with artworks, their social life, heritage, ethnics, cultures and understand art better. Besides, teachers believe that extracurricular activities for art education will provide students with an effective and lasting contribution to learning. Glackin (2016) offered lessons outside in physical education, music and art and design, as it is assumed that gaining such insights will contribute to future outdoor science professional development programs. Goldin (2012) underlines that it is extremely important to support art education curricula with extracurricular trips as such activities contributing to students to reinforce the subjects better. By indicating that extracurricular activities ensure a freer atmosphere for students out of the indoor classroom environment. Jourmeaux and Mottram (2016: 281) emphasize that such kind of activities provide students with opportunities to learn by both learning in theoretical terms and practicing. In the final phase of the research, the teachers' views regarding the measurement

and evaluation aspects of the 8th grade art education programs have been identified.

The outcomes of the research demonstrate that the programs implemented in both communities are inadequate in terms of measurement and evaluation. The majority of the teachers claim that art education is not considered as important as other disciplines adding that evaluation for art education is carried out only at the end of the year. The teachers also underline the necessity of process evaluation for art education. Bland (2016), claiming that year-end evaluation (Shaw 2016) of performance of students is not that effective, suggests evaluating such studies continuously, throughout the implementation process.

CONCLUSION

The overall findings of this research indicate that the art education curricula implemented in Northern and Southern Cyprus has similar aspects in the line with Stufflebeam CIPP evaluation model. Since the art teachers are the basic implementers of the art education programs, they have expressed their opinions regarding the program and argued on the necessity of the renewal and revising of the curricula. In this context, researchers should attach more importance on bicomunal studies and submit proposals to overcome the insufficiencies of the program by reviewing the art education programs in a more detailed manner.

RECOMMENDATIONS

In order to develop more effective art education programs, it is suggested to use quantitative research methods and improve the generalizability level of this kind of research. It is also proposed that the future studies should necessarily cover the art education programs implemented in all elementary levels of art education by taking the views of teachers, students and parents into consideration. By comparing the outcomes of this research with the outcomes of their future research, the researchers need to design a model proposal, too.

The overall findings of this research indicate that,

1. The subjects of the program content must be reviewed, and the length and content of the courses must be carefully planned. It is assumed that by doing this, gains of students will be ensured in full.

2. In order to ensure consolidation of the gains of learning, the content of the program must be supported through the theoretical subjects, and to ensure this, it is recommended to integrate sources including art history and theoretical art issues into the program.
3. Considering the changing and varying needs of students and teachers, it is recommended to review and if necessary, renew the program content.
4. Students' awareness in adopting, preserving and protecting the cultural values must be raised. To do this, it is recommended to integrate cultural aspects of the country into the program.
5. Throughout the implementation process of the program, it is recommended to spare more time to outdoor activities and learning of students to ensure that the students experience a more active learning process and meet the art related facilities.
6. Program evaluation policies, teaching methods and approaches must be reviewed and if necessary, must be changed or renewed in accordance with the needs. To do this, students' performance and attitudes throughout the implementation of courses must be taken into consideration.

LIMITATIONS

This research is limited to evaluation of opinions of the teachers teaching 8th grade art education programs at the secondary private schools in Northern and Southern Parts of Cyprus. The research explored and revealed the similarities and differences between the art education programs of both communities. However, this is not sufficient to arrive at a conclusion and further research must be carried out to explore all the dimensions of this problem. Further research studies must be carried out both, at the private and state school levels in order to find the insufficient points and develop solutions accordingly. Researchers from both communities might carry out joint research to reach to an integrative solution.

REFERENCES

- Akhmetov LV, Badaev VS, Komelina VA, Kuzmin VK 2014. National arts and crafts in the content of art education of Russia. *Review of European Studies*, 7(1): 1.
- Arikan I, Dogan Y 2013. İlköğretim 7. sınıf öğrencilerinin kültürel mirasla ilgili başarı düzeyleri ve tutumlarının bazı değişkenlerce incelenmesi (adiyaman örneği). *Adiyaman Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 6(15): 29-68.
- Ayres P 2015. State of the art research into multimedia learning: A commentary on Mayer's Handbook of Multimedia Learning. *Applied Cognitive Psychology*, 29(4): 631-636.
- Baskan AG, Koruroglu A 2013. An overview and history education in Republic of Turkey and Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 89(3): 786-791.
- Ball AF 2016. Teacher professional development in a complex and changing world: Lessons learned from model teacher education programs in transnational contexts. In: Jo Lampert, Bruce Burnett (Eds.): *Teacher Education for High Poverty Schools*. Springer International Publishing, pp. 115-134.
- Bauer C, Strauss C 2015. Educating artists in management—An analysis of art education programmes in DACH region. *Cogent Education*, 2(1): 1045217.
- Bekerman Z, Zembylas M 2016. Identity negotiations in conflict-ridden societies: Historical and anthropological perspectives. *Paedagogica Historica*, 1-18.
- Beyers T 2005. Cultural education and the canon: A comparative analysis of the content of secondary school exams for music and art in England, France, Germany, and the Netherlands. *Poetics*, 33(5): 388-416.
- Berkemeyer N, Junker R, Bos W, Müthing K 2016. Organizational cultures in education: Theory-based use of an instrument for identifying school culture. *Journal for Educational Research Online/Journal für Bildungsfor schung Online*, 7(3): 86-102.
- Bertacchini E, Segre G 2016. Introduction: Culture, sustainable development and social quality: A paradigm shift in the economic analysis of cultural production and heritage conservation. *City, Culture and Society*, 7(2): 69-70.
- Bland LS 2016. *Effects of a Self-reflective Learning Process on Student Art Performance*. A Dissertation submitted to the Department of Art Education in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. School of Visual Arts and Dance. USA: The Florida State University.
- Buyurgan S, Buyurgan U 2012. *Art Education and Teaching*. 3rd Edition. Ankara: Pegem Publication.
- Bryan Wilson J, Lubar SD 2016. *Art, Craft, Design, Cultural Artifacts*.
- Caetano AP Freire, Vassalo IS, Machado E, Bicho L 2016. Arts and the voice of youth in dialogue. In: Susana Goncalves, Suzanne Majhanovica (Eds.): *Art and Intercultural Dialogue*. Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Sense Publishers, pp. 247-261.
- Coholic DA, Eys M 2016. Benefits of an arts-based mindfulness group intervention for vulnerable children. *Child and Adolescent Social Work Journal*, 33(1): 1-13.
- Costes-Onishi P, Caleon I 2016. Generalists to specialists: Transformative evidences and impediments to student-centered practices of primary music and art teachers in Singapore. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 17(7): 1-27.
- Cosumov M 2016. Strategic dimensions of permanent musical education as a part of the development of personality's musical culture. *Review of Artistic Education*, (11/12): 79.

- Dewey P 2008. A comparative approach to art education policy research. *A Journal of Issues and Research Studies in Art Education*, 49(4): 227-293.
- Dombayci MA 2014. A study into philosophical anthropology of the teaching of philosophy in Turkey. *Anthropologist*, 18(2): 315-324.
- Ertürk M 2013. The evaluation of the curriculum for the visual art education course at primary school in accordance with the teacher opinions. *Anadolu Journal Educational Sciences International*, 3(1): 1-17.
- Evans L, Baskerville R, Nara K 2015. Colliding worlds: Issues relating to language translation in accounting and some lessons from other disciplines. *Abacus*, 51(1): 1-36.
- Fernández MT, De Luna EB, Eisman LB 2014. Intercultural values education in Europe. A comparative analysis of Norwegian and Spanish reality. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 132: 441-446.
- Gandomkar R, Mirzazadeh, A, Jalili M, Sadighpour I 2015. Developing comprehensive course evaluation guidelines in Tehran University of Medical Sciences. *Journal of Advances in Medical Education and Professionalism*, 3(3): 150-151.
- Garnet D 2012. Art education theory and practical experience: My journey as an art educator and amateur theorist. *Teaching Artist Journal*, 10(4): 222-228.
- Gates L 2016. Rethinking art education practice one choice at a time. *Art Education*, 69(2): 14-19.
- Gates K, Hansen D, Tuttle L 2015. Teacher evaluation in the arts disciplines: Three state perspectives. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 116(4): 162-175.
- Gaztambide FR, Nicholls R, Arráiz MA 2016. For what purpose the arts? An analysis of the mission statements of urban arts high schools in Canada and the United States. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 117(1): 29-42.
- Glackin M 2016. 'Risky fun' or 'authentic science'? How teachers' beliefs influence their practice during a professional development programme on outdoor learning. *International Journal of Science Education*, 1-25.
- Golding V 2012. *Learning at the Museum Frontiers: Identity, Race and Power*. U.K: Ashgate Publishing Ltd.
- Gun CD 2015. Anthropological study on the cremated bones of the Late Silla Kingdom Period in Korean History. *Anthropologist*, 19(1): 131-138.
- Gresnigt R, Taconis R, Keulen Van H, Gravemeijer K, Baartman L 2014. Promoting science and technology in primary education: A review of integrated curricula. *Studies in Science Education*, 50(1): 47-84.
- Hallam J, Egan S, Kirkham J 2016. An investigation into the ways in which art is taught in an English Waldorf Steiner school. *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 19: 136-145.
- Higgins RM 2016. Japanese education in an era of globalization: Culture, politics, and equity. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 46(1): 163-166.
- Ispahani EIM, Anwar R 2016. Ceramic Art: An Introduction to MYP Curriculum Design for International Baccalaureate Visual Art. In: *Proceedings of the 2nd International Colloquium of Art and Design Education Research (i-CADER 2015)*, Springer Singapore, 23 March 2016, pp. 21-30.
- Jena RK 2015. Technostress in ICT enabled collaborative learning environment: An empirical study among Indian academician. *Elsevier Science Direct Computers in Human Behavior*, 5: 1116-1123.
- Journeaux J, Mottram J 2016. Creativity and art education gaps between theories and practices. In: Giovanni Emanuele Corazza, Sergio Agnoli (Eds.): *Multidisciplinary Contributions to the Science of Creative Thinking*. Singapore: Springer pp. 281-299.
- Kafola BS, Denach O, Znidarsic J 2015. Opinion of the Slovenian preschool teachers about arts and cultural education in kindergarten. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 197: 1317-1325.
- Kahraman D 2014. *Sınıf Öğretmenlerinin Görsel Sanatlar Dersi Programının Uygulanmasında Karşılaşılan Sorunlara İlişkin Görüşleri ve Çözüm Önerileri*. Abant İzzet Baysal Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi.
- Kalemoglu Y 2011. *Türkiye ve İngiltere'deki İlk Öğretim Beden Eğitimi Dersi Öğretim Programlarının Öğretmen Görüşlerine Göre Karşılaştırmalı Olarak İncelenmesi*. PhD Thesis, Unpublished. Ankara: T.C Gazi University.
- Khan MA, Smith LL 2015. An integrative approach to curriculum development in higher education in the USA: A theoretical framework. *Canadian Center of Science and Education International Education Studies*, 8(3): 1913-2039.
- Koo A 2015. Arts and education for underprivileged people: Community-based art projects case study. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 174: 64-68.
- Kurudayioğlu M, Cavus S 2015. Perceptions of students in Turkish Education Department about folk culture course. *Anthropologist*, 19(3): 603-612.
- Kuttner PJ 2015. Educating for cultural citizenship: Reframing the goals of arts education. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 45(1): 69-92.
- Ladkin S, McKay R, Bojesen E (Eds.) 2016. *Against Value in the Arts and Education*. London: Rowman and Littlefield International.
- Lee YJ 2014. Evaluation of involvement and multidimensions for cultural creativity products in remote districts. *Anthropologist*, 17(3): 795-809.
- Levina EY, Akhmetov LG, Latipova LN, Mirzagitova AL, Mirzanagimova FI, Latipov ZA, Masalimova AR 2015. Diagnostics of educational activity quality on the basis of qualitative methods. *Asian Social Science*, 11(4): 246.
- Lingard B, Mc Gregor G 2014. Two contrasting Australian Curriculum responses to globalisation: What students should learn or become. *The Curriculum Journal*, 25(1): 90-110.
- Lytra V 2014. *When Greeks and Turks Meet. Interdisciplinary Perspectives on the Relationship since 1923*. Goldsmith University of London and King's College of London. London: Ashgate Publishing.
- Mamur N 2010. Görsel sanatlar eğitiminde ölçme ve değerlendirme. *Pamukkale Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 28: 175-188.
- Mesquita A, Peres P 2016. Critical success factors in the adoption of technologies in education in higher education: The case of ISCAP (Polytechnic of Porto). *International Journal of Online Pedagogy and Course Design (IJOPCD)*, 6(1): 29-41.
- Miller JR 2016. Teaching machines: Learning from the intersection of education and technology by

- Bill Ferster. *The Review of Higher Education*, 39(2): 306-307.
- Morley S 2014. Analytic and holistic approaches to fine art education: A comparative approach. *Journal of Visual Art Practice*, 13(2): 101-113.
- Murray JW 2016. Skills development, habits of mind, and the spiral curriculum: A dialectical approach to undergraduate general education curriculum mapping. *Cogent Education*, 3(1): 1156807.
- Nickolaou Avtzaki Maria 2012. *Education and Ethnic Conflict Resolution: Bi-Communal Academic Links in Cyprus*. PhD Thesis, Unpublished. Nottingham: The University of Nottingham School of Education.
- Ocal T 2016. Necessity of cultural historical heritage education in social studies teaching. *Creative Education*, 7(03): 396.
- Papadakis K, Bé D 2008. *Cross-border Social Dialogue and Agreements: An Emerging Global Industrial Relations Framework?* Intl Labour Organisation.
- Park HY, Cho II-HC, Sook J, Main D 2015. Information and communication technology and user knowledge-driven innovation in services. *Information and Technology Management*, 2(1): 1-18.
- Pinilla SM, Moliní, DV, Fernández-Balbuena AA, Raboso GH, Herráez JA, Azcutia M, Botella ÁG 2016. Advanced daylighting evaluation applied to cultural heritage buildings and museums: Application to the cloister of Santa Maria El Paular. *Renewable Energy*, 85: 1362-1370.
- Priestley M, Minty S, Eager M 2014. School-based curriculum development in Scotland: Curriculum policy and enactment. *Pedagogy, Culture and Society*, 22(2): 189-211.
- Priestley M, Biesta GJJ, Robinson S 2012. Understanding Teacher Agency: The Importance of Relationships. *A Paper Presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association*, Vancouver, Canada, pp.13-17, 4 October 2012.
- Rohaan E, Keulen Van H 2011. *What Everyone Should Know About Science and Technology*. Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Sense Publishers.
- Schlosnagle L, McBean AL, Cutlip M, Panzironi H, Jarmolowicz DP 2014. Evaluating the fine arts program at the center for excellence in disabilities. *Art Therapy*, 31(3): 110-117.
- See BH, Kokotsaki D 2016. Impact of arts education on children's learning and wider outcomes. *Review of Education*, 4(3): 234-262.
- Sinclair M 2015. *Structuring Multicultural Art Education to Encourage Positive Cultural Identity: Recommendations for Secondary Art Teachers*. Arts & Administration Program. Oregon: University of Oregon.
- Scott D 2016. International comparisons. In: *New Perspectives on Curriculum, Learning and Assessment*. Switzerland: Springer International Publishing, pp. 111-141.
- Scupin, R 2015. *Cultural Anthropology A Global Perspective*. U.K., England: Pearson.
- Smith JA 2016. *Qualitative Psychology: A Practical Guide to Research Methods*. Los Angeles: Sage Publications.
- Smith RC, Otto T 2016. Cultures of the future: Emergence and intervention in design anthropology. In: RC Smith, KT Vangkilde, MG Kjaersgaard, Totto, J Halse, T Binda. *Design Anthropological Futures*. Bloomsbury Academic.
- Sparapani EF, Perez DV, Gould J, Hillman S, Clark LC 2014. *A Global Curriculum? Understanding Teaching and Learning in the United States, Taiwan, India and Mexico*. Los Angeles, USA: Sage Publications. DOI: 10.1177/2158244014536406.
- Shaw RD 2016. Arts teacher evaluation: How did we get here? *Arts Education Policy Review*, 117(1): 1-12.
- Tondeur J, Pareja RN, van Braak J, Voogt J, Prestridge S 2016. Preparing beginning teachers for technology integration in education: Ready for take-off? *Technology, Pedagogy and Education*, <http://nde.handle.net/1854/LU-7029712>.
- Tüzel SH 2013. Türkiye ve Kanada (Ontario Eyaletleri) görsel sanatlar eğitimi programlarının karşılaştırılması. *Akdeniz Sanat Dergisi*, 6(11): 1-11.
- Uzuntosun MS, Troudi S 2015. Lecturers' views of curriculum change at English language teaching departments in Turkey. *Novitas Royal Research on Youth and Language*, 9(1): 15-29.
- Wyse D, Ferrari A 2015. Creativity and education: Comparing the national curricula of the states of the European Union and the United Kingdom. *British Educational Research Journal*, 41(1): 30-47.
- Walmsley B 2016. Deep hanging out in the arts: An anthropological approach to capturing cultural value. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 1-20.
- Wan G, Scott MR 2016. Start them early and right: Creating a culture of academic integrity in elementary schools. *Handbook of Academic Integrity*, 413.
- Watson K, Salter A 2016. Playing art historian: Teaching 20th century art through alternate reality gaming. *International Journal for Scholarship of Technology Enhanced Learning*, 1(1): 100-111.
- Woywod C, Deal R 2016. Art that makes communities strong: Transformative partnerships with community artists in K-12 settings. *Art Education*, 69(2): 43-51.
- Vella R 2016. Becoming the middle sea: Portraits of the Mediterranean in art education. *International Journal of Education through Art*, 12(1): 109-122.
- Vermeersch L 2016. Enhancing Cultural Awareness and Expression: Lessons for the Future Based on Current Practices in Europe. In: *Cultural Awareness and Expression Handbook*. Publication Office of the European Union, pp. 37-58.
- Yigiter K 2015. The effects of a summer camp on social anthropological improvement of the kids in Turkey. *Anthropologist*, 19(1): 65-68.